Recent advances in developing multiscale descriptor approach for the design of oxygen redox electrocatalysts

Zhang, Dantong; Zhang, Qi; Peng, Chao; Long, Zhi; Zhuang, Guilin; Kramer, Denis; Komarneni, Sridhar; Zhi, Chunyi; Xue, Dongfeng

Published in: iScience

Published: 19/05/2023

Document Version: Final Published version, also known as Publisher's PDF, Publisher’s Final version or Version of Record

License: CC BY-NC-ND

Publication record in CityU Scholars: Go to record

Published version (DOI): 10.1016/j.isci.2023.106624


Citing this paper
Please note that where the full-text provided on CityU Scholars is the Post-print version (also known as Accepted Author Manuscript, Peer-reviewed or Author Final version), it may differ from the Final Published version. When citing, ensure that you check and use the publisher's definitive version for pagination and other details.

General rights
Copyright for the publications made accessible via the CityU Scholars portal is retained by the author(s) and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing these publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights. Users may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain.

Publisher permission
Permission for previously published items are in accordance with publisher's copyright policies sourced from the SHERPA RoMEO database. Links to full text versions (either Published or Post-print) are only available if corresponding publishers allow open access.

Take down policy
Contact lbscholars@cityu.edu.hk if you believe that this document breaches copyright and provide us with details. We will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.
Recent advances in developing multiscale descriptor approach for the design of oxygen redox electrocatalysts

Dantong Zhang, Qi Zhang, Chao Peng, Zhi Long, Guilin Zhuang, Denis Kramer, Sridhar Komarneni, Chunyi Zhi, and Dongfeng Xue

SUMMARY
Oxygen redox electrocatalysis is the crucial electrode reaction among new-era energy sources. The prerequisite to rationally design an ideal electrocatalyst is accurately identifying the structure-activity relationship based on the so-called descriptors which link the catalytic performance with structural properties. However, the quick discovery of those descriptors remains challenging. In recent, the high-throughput computing and machine learning methods were identified to present great prospects for accelerating the screening of descriptors. That new research paradigm improves cognition in the way of oxygen evolution reaction/oxygen reduction reaction activity descriptor and reinforces the understanding of intrinsic physical and chemical features in the electrocatalytic process from a multiscale perspective. This review summarizes those new research paradigms for screening multiscale descriptors, especially from atomic scale to cluster mesoscale and bulk macroscale. The development of descriptors from traditional intermediate to eigen feature parameters has been addressed which provides guidance for the intelligent design of new energy materials.

INTRODUCTION
Oxygen redox electrochemical reactions, namely the oxygen evolution reaction (OER) and the oxygen reduction reaction (ORR) are the key electrode reactions in the aspect of green energy storage and conversions, for instance, alkaline fuel cells and metal-air batteries (Figure 1A). The OER and ORR catalytic activity directly determines the battery performance including energy conversion efficiency, battery charge/discharge rate, and power density. In terms of the reversible OER and ORR reactions in batteries, the single catalyst cannot meet the satisfaction of both reactions. For example, the most active electrocatalyst for OER is RuO₂, showing great electrical and ionic conductivity, while this catalyst is not suitable for ORR because of the too weak O₂ binding ability. The state-of-art electrocatalyst for ORR is Pt, while the formation of Pt oxide film in OER decays the long-term stability. Therefore, rationally designing bifunctional low-cost OER/ORR electrocatalysts satisfying the catalytic performance including activity and long lifetime has attracted much attention. The key to catalyst design is identifying the effective descriptor linking structure and activity to accelerate the cycle of the research and development (R&D) process for quickly screening excellent catalysts from the materials database. However, due to the complicated catalytic process, discovering the effective bifunctional descriptor to meet the electrocatalytic activity and the selectivity remains a challenge. The OER and ORR activity was highly dependent on the adsorbed Gibbs free energy of the three key intermediates *OOH, *O, and *OH. The classical Sabatier principle exhibits that the superior catalytic performance occurs when interactions between the catalyst and the reactant are of moderate strength exhibited at the top of the Balandine-type “volcano curve”. However, there lacks efficient way in correlating the binding strength of the intermediate with the eigen electronic and geometric structure of catalysts, thus generating a barrier to identifying the intrinsic descriptor for the design and synthesis of OER/ORR catalysts.

The era of big data provides an opportunity for the investigation of intrinsic descriptors based on the new paradigms development of high-throughput computing and machine learning (ML) used in materials screening and designing. Even though the d-band center (ε_d) was verified to have a generally linear correlation with OER/ORR activity in the majority of catalytic systems, the coordination of active sites, size of the
catalyst, and related factors were also found to show impacts. 15–17 Single-atom catalysts are hot-pot materials due to the large specific surface area. 18–20 The overpotential and current density of metal-N-C systems are highly correlated with the N-C coordination environment. The cluster mesoscale material is generally composed of highly active metallic centers and ligands, and its performance not only depends on the d electron center but also relates to the geometric structure of the bond length, bond angle, and coordinated ligands. 21,22 The performance of three-dimensional metal oxides is highly correlated with the electron spin state and band center of the metal part. 23 Therefore, finding out the influences of those factors and parameterizing them as descriptors endowing with different importance are crucial to constructing structure-performance relationships for designing highly active and stable OER/ORR catalysts. 24,25

There are considerable amount of literature published to discuss the descriptors which can be classified into two categories including electronic- and geometric-based descriptors. For the electronic-based descriptors, i.e., εd, eg filling, p-band center, transferred charge amount, electronegativity, electron affinity, and ionization potential/energy, have been widely developed. The catalytic performance of transition metal oxides (TMOs) has been found sensitive to electronic orbital. There exist higher exchange current densities and lower Tafel’s slope in TMOs with filled t2g orbitals and partially filled eg orbitals than that in TMOs with partially t2g orbitals and empty eg orbitals. 26 From a quantitative perspective, the d-band theory was thereafter proposed and has been widely applied in heterogeneous catalysis. The εd of transition metals (TMs) in a single-atom TMs-N4-C system was found to be highly sensitive to ligand-effect, strain-effect, and the coordination number of Nitride-Carbon around the active site. The relative position of εd and Fermi level can be used as the descriptor to explore the structure-activity relation. Furthermore, the geometric-based descriptor also acts as auxiliary composition to improve the accuracy score of structure-performance prediction. Atomic radius, atomic volume, space group, system symmetry as well as coordination number are the main geometric descriptors, linked to the catalytic properties. The combination of geometric and electronic features often provides a more precise description of the catalyst’s performance. Compared to the single-component descriptor of coordinated atomic numbers that reflecting the geometric environment of active centers, the multi-component descriptor including both bond energy, chemical environment, and geometric coordinated atomic number is more precisely to describe the catalytic performance of Pt catalyst and TMOs. 27

Although the descriptors for catalyst design have achieved great progress, the single descriptor still has inherent limitations to completely describe the properties of the catalyst. In this review, we summarized the development and limitation of benchmark descriptors as well as the application and prospect of multi-feature composite descriptors achieved by ML methods with new insights paid from the atomic microscale to the cluster mesoscale and the bulk macroscale (Figure 1B). 28,29 The descriptor feature importance and correlation to obtain guidelines for interface engineering were addressed. Finally, we discussed the applications and showed the perspective for the development of descriptors to design better heterogeneous catalysts.
REACTION MECHANISM FOR OER AND ORR

Understanding OER/ORR mechanism is essential to design superior bifunctional oxygen redox electrocatalysts. The OER/ORR activity is closely related to the reaction paths and complex oxygen intermediates. Thus, this section provides an overview of the intermediate process and reaction mechanism of the reversible oxygen redox reactions, providing new insight into novel theoretical guidance for designing the optimal bifunctional OER/ORR electrocatalysts.

OER mechanism

OER is an important reaction in alkaline fuel cells and secondary metal-air batteries. However, the unbefitting binding strength and depressed reaction dynamics of oxygenated intermediates on the OER catalyst impose a large inherent overpotential. Currently, IrO$_2$ and RuO$_2$ are the mainly commercial and benchmark OER catalyst, but their scarce resources limit further applications. Over the past few years, the OER catalysts were focused on metal oxide, perovskite, and spinel materials. The recognized OER mechanism was based on the adsorbate evolution mechanism (AEM) (Figure 2A) and lattices oxygen oxidation mechanism (LOM) (Figure 2B). There exists highly linear correlation between adsorption Gibbs free energy of three adsorbed intermediates in AEM process, thus causing the minimum theoretical overpotential around 0.37 V. And the restriction of minimum overpotential is removed by the direct O-O coupling between lattice and adsorbed oxygen atoms in LOM process. AEM can be considered as a redox reaction of metal cations, and oxygen generation in alkaline solution is follows Equations 1, 2, 3, and 4, exhibited a four-electron transfer process. (Equation 5)

\[
\begin{align*}
* + OH^- (aq) & \rightarrow *OH + e^- & (\text{Equation 1}) \\
*OH + OH^- (aq) & \rightarrow *O + H_2O (l) + e^- & (\text{Equation 2}) \\
*O + OH^- (aq) & \rightarrow *OOH + e^- & (\text{Equation 3}) \\
*OOH + OH^- (aq) & \rightarrow * + O_2 + H_2O + e^- & (\text{Equation 4}) \\
\text{Overall: } 4OH^- (aq) & \rightarrow O_2 (g) + 2H_2O (l) + 4e^- & (\text{Equation 5})
\end{align*}
\]
The oxygen catalytic reaction cycle process is four electrons reaction steps. Precisely, in alkaline electrolytes, OER starts with the adsorption of OH\(^-\), by generating an *OH free radical. It is followed by the deprotonation of *OH with forming *O accompanied by one electron and one water molecule released. The coupling of adsorbed *O and *OH generates the *OOH intermediate which further conducts with a proton-coupled electron transfer process and produces an oxygen molecule and a free-active site (*). The kinetics of OER is mainly determined by the binding strength of oxygen adsorbates such as *OOH and *O intermediate on the active sites.\(^{24}\) The formation of *OOH is generally recognized as the rate-limiting step, hence the *OOH adsorption free energy (\(\Delta G_{\text{OOH}}\)) is normally treated as the descriptor of OER overpotential (\(\eta^{\text{OER}}\)).

**ORR mechanism**

ORR is widely employed as the cathode reaction in various next-generation energy conversion cells. Actually, ORR process acts as either dissociative or associative, induced by the different oxygen adsorbed models and dissociated barrier on the surface of electrocatalysts. There are two reaction models of ORR: (1) the direct four-electron pathway based on parallel manner \(O_2\) adsorption configuration (Figure 3A), and (2) the indirect four-electron pathway mediated by the end-on manner \(O_2\) adsorption configuration (Figure 3B). The indirect four-electron pathways are composed of two parts. Firstly, the end-on adsorption \(O_2\) molecule changes to \(H_2O_2\). Secondly, \(H_2O_2\) undergoes another two-electron process to produce \(H_2O\). Generally, the ORR performance following the indirect four-electron reaction path is relatively poor related to that of the direct four-electron pathway.\(^{38}\)

The direct 4e\(^-\) pathways of ORR are outlined as follows:

\[
* + O_2 + H_2O (l) + e^- \rightarrow *OOH + OH^-(aq) \quad (\text{Equation 6})
\]

\[
*OOH + e^- \rightarrow *O + OH^-(aq) \quad (\text{Equation 7})
\]

\[
*O + H_2O (l) + e^- \rightarrow *OH + OH^-(aq) \quad (\text{Equation 8})
\]
The indirect $4e^-$ pathways reaction equation is as follows:

$$\text{O}_2 + \text{H}_2\text{O} (l) + 2e^- \rightarrow \text{HO}_2^- + \text{OH}^- (aq) \quad (\text{Equation 10})$$

$$\text{HO}_2^- + \text{H}_2\text{O} (l) + 2e^- \rightarrow 3\text{OH}^- (aq) \quad (\text{Equation 11})$$

Overall in either direct or indirect $4e^-$ pathway, as shown in Equation 12:

$$\text{O}_2 (g) + 2\text{H}_2\text{O} + 4e^- \rightarrow 4\text{OH}^- (aq) \quad (\text{Equation 12})$$

The ORR process involves multi-elementary steps including $\text{O}_2$ adsorption, hydration, peroxide/oxide formation, and desorption of surface hydroxide. At the early work, the adsorption Gibbs free energy of the key intermediates in ORR process were calculated by density functional theory (DFT) in Nørskov’s work. It was found the overpotential is generated by the thermodynamic limiting potential ($U_L$), which can be defined as $\eta = \Delta G_{\text{max}} (\Delta G_{\text{OOH}}, \Delta G_{\text{OH}}, \text{and } \Delta G_0)/e$. Remarkably, there exists a linear relationship between the binding Gibbs free energies of the three intermediates ($\Delta G_{\text{OOH}} = \Delta G_{\text{OH}} + 3.2 \pm 0.2$ eV and $\Delta G_0 = 2\Delta G_{\text{OH}}$) as shown in Figures 3C and 3D, and the $U_L$ is also a function of $\Delta G_{\text{OOH}}$ and $\Delta G_{\text{OH}}$. Thus, the adsorbed Gibbs free energies of the three oxygenated intermediates are identified as the earliest ORR activity descriptor.\textsuperscript{39}

For acid solution, the $\text{OH}^- - e^-$ in Equations 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, and 12 instead by $\text{H}^+ + e^-$, and the Gibbs free energy of $\text{H}^+ + e^-$ can be related to $\text{OH}^- - e^-$ according to Equations 13 and 14. Thus, in both alkaline and acid solution, the key intermediates are $\text{O}^*$, $\text{OH}^*$, and $\text{OOH}^*$\textsuperscript{40} and act as the activity feature parameters. The reversible transfer rate between water and $\text{O}_2$ molecule are highly dependent on the electron/proton transfer rate at each elementary step:

$$\text{H}^+ + e^- \rightarrow 1/2\text{H}_2 (g) \quad (\text{Equation 13})$$

$$\mu\text{OH}^- - \mu e^- = \mu\text{H}_2\text{O} (l) - (1/2 \mu\text{H}_2 (g) - eU_{\text{RHE}}) \quad (\text{Equation 14})$$

where $\mu$ are the (electro)chemical potentials of the indicated species.

In either OER or ORR, the redox reactions shown in Equations 5 and 12 require substantial overpotentials. Scaling relationships between limiting potential and binding Gibbs free energy of intermediates can be adopted for increasing the predictive efficiency of novel catalysts. But it still has significant drawbacks on electrocatalysts design due to only considering the adsorption energy. Recently, it was expected the electronic and geometric properties of electrocatalysts are sufficient regarding as descriptors for the OER/ORR performance in the terms of high-throughput computing and ML algorithms\textsuperscript{41}.

**PROGRESS ON DESCRIPTOR-BASED APPROACH FOR OXYGEN REDOX REACTIONS**

The electrocatalytic reaction process of OER/ORR occurs at complicated solid-liquid interfaces influenced by the atomic active site and coordination environment and solvent effects. Therefore, it is necessary to review the descriptors identified from the atomic microscale, cluster mesoscale, and bulk macroscale for feature engineering and materials intelligent design in oxygen redox reaction. In this section, the latest progress and limitation of multiscale descriptors were summarized containing geometric properties, electronic properties, and corresponding composite structures in the application of catalyst design for OER and ORR. The accurate cognition of descriptors effectively promotes the prediction of the performance and design of new materials, which is of great significance for the rapid development of materials in the new era.

**Descriptor development for atomic-scale catalysts**

Atomic scale electrocatalysts include M-N-C (M: metal) and M\textsubscript{1}-M\textsubscript{2}-N-C structures, which present high-density active catalytic sites. The TMs-N-C (TMs = Fe, Co, Ni, Mn, etc.) show great performance toward heterogeneous catalysis because of the advantages of superior electrical conductivity and high intrinsic
OER/ORR activity originated from TMs active sites and surrounded nitride/carbon atoms. Compared to TMs-N-C systems, the pure nitrogen-doped carbon-based materials is unbenefited for OER process, which suffer from the rapid oxidation and dissociation with the formation of carbon dioxide above 0.207 V under the high potentials (>1.4 V vs. Standard Hydrogen Electrode [SHE]). The doped TMs in NC material increase the graphitization of systems to suppress the corrosion and charge accumulation in the OER process. Therefore, doped TMs in carbon materials are effective to achieve high performance for both ORR and OER. For transition metal–nitrogen–carbon (TM-N-C) atomic-scale materials, the ε_d, charge transfer, unsaturated coordination number, and another composite descriptor can construct a relationship between activity and intrinsic physical and chemical properties.42,43

Adsorption energy of intermediate

Overpotential can directly reflect OER/ORR performance for electrocatalyst and is relative to the adsorption free energy of intermediates. However, the rate-limiting steps are different in OER and ORR processes for TM-N-C systems, and it imposes difficulty to construct descriptors from one intermediate for both OER and ORR. Recent studies show that ΔGOH, ΔGO, and ΔGOOH+ΔGO are the three potential descriptors of overpotential in various TM-N-C systems. Waterhouse et al. calculated three key intermediates including OH*, OOH*, and O on 60 different 3d-transition metal single-atom systems (3d-TM-SACs) with symmetric and asymmetric coordination environment. The symmetric configurations (TM-N_x-C) is composed of various nitrogen numbers (x = 4, 3, 2), and the asymmetric configuration (TM-N_3X-C) consists of nitrogen and various non-metal elements (X = P, S, B). The adsorbed Gibbs free energy of OOH* and O* have a linear relationship with ORR overpotential, and the different in OER and ORR due to their different rate-limiting step. The adsorption free energy of *OOH in-}

\[
\Delta E_d = \Delta E_{d,\text{hyb}} + \Delta E_{d,\text{ortho}}
\]

(Equation 15)

There also exists sp-band in TMs, which originates from the valence s and p orbitals in a broad overlapping shape. The research exhibited that energy contribution from free electron-like sp electrons is independent of the metals, which implies that the adsorption energy for the adsorbates is directly related to the d-band electronic states.67 The ε_d is the simplest descriptor for the d-band electrons, in which the positive shift of ε_d toward the Fermi level indicates the stronger interaction, while a negative shift of ε_d is accompanied by weaker interaction.

The TM-N-C catalysts are currently the hot spot materials for bifunctional catalysts. Accurately predicting their active site becomes very important but challenging. Neither experiment nor theoretical modeling can traverse all possible single-atom structures quickly with low cost. Recently, on the basis of the cross-validation scheme of DFT and machine learning, the fundamental relationship between geometric/electronic structure and OER/ORR overpotential can be easily obtained by the best-performing machine learning model in the TM-N-C systems. It was declared that the ε_d was proved to be the important descriptor in various TM-N-C atomic scale catalysts.4,48

Guo and coworkers investigated 3d-4d-5d TM atoms embedded in different coordination C-N numbers consisting of C_3N, C_2N, C_2N_5, C_4N_3, C_3N_3, and C_3N_4 (Figure 5A.48 The calculated Gibbs free energy
can be well fitted by various ML models, thus the ML model training result can accurately predict the catalytic activity in the use of TMs-N-C systems. The result shows that RhPc, Co-N-C, and Rh-C \( 4N3 \) are the three promising oxygen electrocatalysts with low overpotential. As shown in Figures 5 B and 5C, the importance of various feature parameters was analysis by random forest regression (RFR) models. The electron number of the \( d \) orbital (\( e_d \)) is the most importance features for both OER and ORR with feature importance of 40.62% and 48.94%. Even though the \( d \) electron is the most important descriptor, the thermodynamic

**Figure 4. The different intermediate descriptors and corresponding electronic state in the metal-nitride-carbon system**

(A) The scaling relationship between OER/ORR limiting potential and \( \Delta G_{\text{OH}} \) in 3d-TM-SACs systems. (B) The dual volcano plot of OER/ORR overpotential for 3d-TM-SACs systems. Reproduced with permission from \(^{18}\) copyright 2022 Elsevier. (C) Thermodynamic volcano plot between OER/ORR performance and \( \Delta G_{\text{O}} \) for TMs-N\( _4 \)-C systems. (D) OER theoretical overpotential (\( \eta_{\text{OER}}^{\text{th}} \)) versus \( \Delta G_{\text{OOH}} \). (E) OER theoretical overpotential (\( \eta_{\text{OER}}^{\text{th}} \)) versus \( \Delta G_{\text{OH}} \). (F) The charge transfer number in TMs-N\( _4 \)-C (TM = Fe, Co, Ni) systems. (G) Projected electronic density of state of TMs-N\( _4 \)-C (TM = Co, Fe) systems. Reproduced with permission from. \(^{45}\) Copyright 2018 American Chemical Society.
and geometric properties such as enthalpy, coordination number, and atomic radius are still factors to be reckoned with. By combining DFT and ML method, that work opens a new approach for rational and low-cost design principle of ideal catalysts by exploring the importance ratio of different features to predict and design a new class of OER/ORR electrocatalysts.

The two-dimensional nanomaterials present novel physical and chemical properties, including robust mechanical properties, high specific surface area, and abundant active sites. The d-band center descriptor is also suitable as descriptor for the two-dimensional TM-semiconductor substrate such as transition-metal sulfide, phosphide, and nitride. Deng’s group investigated the OER performance of the graphene-like GaN monolayer doped with TM atoms (3d metals, Ru, Pd, Pt, and Au). The results showed that M/g-GaN (M = Fe, Ni, Au) can be used as a highly active bifunctional catalyst. $\Delta G_{\text{OH}}$ and $\Delta G_{\text{OOH}}$ are linear related to the TM atomic d-band centers.\(^{50}\) Zhang and coworkers explored the AlP monolayer based on the TM and nitrogen doping through theoretical modeling.\(^{49}\) They achieved higher OER/ORR activity by replacing two P atoms with two nitrogen atoms in the TM-anchored AlP monolayers (Figure 5D). Furthermore, the $r_{\text{dd}}$, d-orbital electron number and the electronegativity of the TM atom were identified to be good descriptors of OER/ORR activity in TM-anchored AlP materials. As shown in Figure 5E, after

---

**Figure 5.** ML fitting and feature importance analysis in different atomic models including TM-NC and TM@VAl-2Np-AlP

(A) Heatmap of ML-predict limiting potentials in OER and ORR of TM/N-C systems.  
(B) The feature importance analysis by RFR models of various feature parameters for OER and ORR.  
(C) The radar comparison chart on the RFR analysis feature importance of various feature parameters on the feature importance of features in the RFR models for OER and ORR. Reproduced with permission from\(^{49}\) copyright 2018 Elsevier.  
(D) Atomic models of TM@VAl-2Np-AlP-based substrate and corresponding TM elements as SAC candidates.  
(E) Brief description of the ML process.  
(F) The scaling relationship between DFT calculated and ML fitted $\Delta G_{\text{OH}}$ value and corresponding feature importance analysis by ML models. Reproduced with permission from\(^{49}\) copyright 2022 American Chemical Society.
performing an ML algorithm (GBR, gradient boosted regression), the TM d-electron number and charge transfer of TM atoms are the main descriptors of the adsorption behavior, realizing the descriptors from catalyst overall characteristics of atoms. The optimal single-atom catalysts derived by ML can be further verified by DFT calculations to determine the reliability and accuracy of the model (Figure 5F).

**Geometry-related descriptors**

The geometry-related descriptors have more significant contribution to the atomic-scale electrocatalysts compared to bulk materials, generally including coordination number, bond length, bond angle, space group, and symmetry. In Liu’s work, different kinds of Fe-atom-doped carbon-defective models were constructed to investigate the relation between performance and the related descriptor (Figures 6A and 6B). The Fe-O bond length at the Fe active site and adsorbed O₂ molecule is the descriptor that accurately predicts the ORR overpotential in Fe-N₄-C with various defective systems (Figure 6C). Li’s group proposed a data-driven high-throughput design principle by combining DFT and ML. In this work, the intrinsic descriptor (Equation 16) contained geometric and electronic structure in all 3d, 4d, and 5d biatoms doped defect nitrogen-doped carbon structure was constructed (Figure 6D). The theoretical results achieved by the data-driven high-throughput design principle shows that there exist 511 and 855 types of double-atom catalysts (DACs) superior than IrO₂ and Pt in OER and ORR activity. They also found 248 kinds of bifunctional DACs presenting superior catalytic activity for both OER and ORR (Figures 6E and 6F). The intrinsic descriptor (Equation 16) is as follows:

\[
\varphi = \frac{\theta_d}{N_N + N_C} 
\]  

(Equation 16)

\(\theta_d\) is the valence electrons of metal elements, \(\chi\) is the electronegativity and \(N_N\) and \(N_C\) are the number of nitrogen and carbon atom coordinated with the metal, respectively.

**Composite descriptors**

The application of ML endows more convenient and accurate descriptors in OER/ORR. Compared to the one-component descriptor, the multi-component descriptor including the d-band center theory, coordination environment, electronegativity, and ionization energy is more accurate to predict OER/ORR activity. The key process is extracting important feature parameters from hundreds of physical and chemical parameters. ML algorithm becomes very effective to filter the different feature parameters and construct the multi-component descriptor. Huang et al. performed ML model training based on the RFR to find the performance descriptors for OER/ORR. Precisely, the number of electrons and the enthalpy change for oxide formation were found to be two important factors to affect the bifunctional OER/ORR activity of single-atom catalysts. Moreover, the data-driven high-throughput design principle was proposed to estimate the stability and activity of diatomic structures in OER. The effective approach with a high prediction accuracy of \(R^2 > 0.926\) lowers the screening time by 1,44,000 times compared to the DFT method. This data-oriented research method greatly accelerates the design and discovery of high-performance diatomic catalysts.

Xia and coworker constructed a series of structures of X-doped carbon (X = N, B, P, S, Si, Se, Sb, F, Cl, Br, I, POH, SOH, PO₂, SeO₂, SO₂, etc.) (Figure 7A), where \(F\), a dimensionless factor defined as shown in Equation 17, can be treated as the bifunctional descriptor to predict the effect of structural characteristics:

\[
F = \left( \frac{E_X}{E_C} \right) \times \left( \frac{A_X}{A_C} \right) 
\]  

(Equation 17)

\(E_X\) is the electronegativity and \(A_X\) is the electron affinity. By considering the combined effects of the electron adhesion and \(E_X\) of the dopant on the redistribution of charge on the systems, the p-orbital element doping effect was formulated to predict OER/ORR performance. The finding can be attributed as follows: the ability to form covalent bonds with carbon and the ability to transfer electrons in the reaction, which reduces the overpotential and stabilizes the adsorbate, thereby enabling fast OER/ORR kinetics. Based on the scaling relationship between the binding strength and OER/RR limiting potential, nitrogen and phosphorus were proved as the optimal doped elements for graphene in applications of OER and ORR, respectively. More precisely, when the composite descriptor (\(F\)) fluctuates in 1–3 for ORR, 0.5–2 for OER, the predicted performance is superior than the benchmark catalysts of Pt and RuO₂ in ORR and OER. The research shows that the p-orbital element-doped graphene have potential to be the bifunctional catalysts for OER and ORR (Figures 7B and 7C).

Additionally, Chen et al. reported alkynyl single-atom configurations (M@C₃, M@C₄, M@pyridine-M₈, and M@pyrrole-N₄). The ML models were used to describe readily available physical properties and fundamental
modes of limiting potential, predicting 260 kinds of graphene-supported catalysts containing metal N<sub>x</sub>C<sub>y</sub> active sites. It was found that the top few characteristic parameters in ORR/OER activity are the <i>d</i>-band center, oxygen formation enthalpy, electronegativity, <i>H</i><sub>xf</sub> (hydride formation enthalpy) and average electronegativity. The accuracy of the ML models in this work were also verified by DFT calculations. Important lines of various descriptors were proposed, which are instructive for the screening and design of structures for similar systems.

Huang’s research group regulated biatom embedded g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> structure and built a model containing 26 homonuclear and 253 heteronuclear biatom/g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> (M<sub>2</sub>/g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub> and M<sub>1</sub>M<sub>2</sub>/g-C<sub>3</sub>N<sub>4</sub>) (Figure 7D). Through the ML technology model training, it is found that the features of <i>L</i>, <i>d</i>, and <i>R</i><sub>coval-ul</sub> show an obvious effect on catalytic activity (Figures 7E and 7F). Three features are identified as the distance of two metal atoms (<i>L</i>), the average bond length between the surrounding nitrogen atoms and metal atoms (<i>d</i> = <i>d</i><sub>1</sub> + <i>d</i><sub>2</sub> + <i>d</i><sub>3</sub> + <i>d</i><sub>4</sub> + <i>d</i><sub>5</sub> + <i>d</i><sub>6</sub>/6), the covalent radius (<i>R</i><sub>coval-ul</sub>). Followed this principle, they identified that AuRh/g-CN with a small overpotential of 0.35 V for ORR and AgPd/g-CN with a small overpotential of 0.43 and 0.48 V for OER and ORR, which can be
used as a promising bifunctional electrocatalyst. According to the ML analysis and fitting, the other feature parameters such as valence electrons and unpaired electrons in the occupied d orbital, Pauling electronegativity, the number of carbon and nitrogen atoms closest to the metallic center were also considered as the contributed descriptor to predict the OER/ORR performance in 3d-5d TMs-N-C systems.\textsuperscript{17} The research shows that the coordinated N/C number is the most importance feature parameters to affect the activity and stability. Among various -N\textsubscript{n}C\textsubscript{m} moieties, the -N\textsubscript{2}C\textsubscript{2} moieties tend to be easily formed and show higher electrochemical catalytic performance and longer durability than other materials such as Pt/Ni-N\textsubscript{2}C\textsubscript{2}.

**Figure 7.** The composite descriptor contained electronic structure and coordination environment controlled OER/ORR performance  
(A) Atomic models of the X-doped graphene nanoribbons and corresponding elemental dopant position.  
(B) The relationship between OER/ORR overpotential and composite descriptor (\(\Phi\)).  
(C) The limiting current density and onset potential as a function of composite descriptor (\(\Phi\)). Reproduced with permission from\textsuperscript{52} copyright 2022 The Royal Society of Chemistry.  
(D) The optimized structure, calculated \(E_f\) (formation energy) and \(U_{diss}\) (dissolution potential) for Mo/g-CN, considered metal atoms M.  
(E) The fitted Pearson correlation coefficient between various selected features of biatom catalysts systems.  
(F) The feature importance analysis for OER and ORR overpotential achieved by RFR models fitting. Reproduced with permission from\textsuperscript{53} copyright 2022 The Royal Society of Chemistry.

**Descriptor development for cluster-mesoscale catalysts**

Clusters, as the mesoscale materials, are important units that connect the atomic microscale and the bulk macroscale, where their properties differ from single atoms and their bulk material counterparts. Bulk metals have electron band structures, while clusters have discrete electron energies, specific sizes, shapes, and unique electronic structures. The cluster material is usually deposited on the substrate which acts as a composite catalyst. The shape and electronic structure of clusters are also correlated with the substrate properties, and their performance is highly decided by the assembled properties of the cluster and the corresponding substrate. The unsaturated coordination environment of cluster catalysts and dynamic structure evolution show significant impact on the reaction performance. Extraction of environmental descriptors, therefore, plays a certain role in promoting the intelligent design of cluster catalysts.
Coordination environment descriptor

The descriptor for a cluster can be classified into coordination environment, d-band electrons distribution, and other composite functions. In Ham’s work, the Pt\(_3\)/Pt nanoalloy catalysts (M = 3d TM) for OER and ORR were investigated using DFT calculation (Figures 8A and 8B).\(^{27}\) The strain and ligand effects were found to be the key factors for OER/ORR catalytic activities. Compared to pure Pt crystals with (111) lattice plane exposed, the OER/ORR activities in a Pt\(_3\)/Pt\(_{\text{Skin}}\) were increased by 13.7% and 18.4% attributed to the lattice train and ligand impacts. Zhao’s work also exhibited that OER/ORR performance depends on the cluster size and metal atomic numbers. Several palladium (Pd\(_n\), \(n = 1–6, \) and 13) nanoclusters anchored on the surface of defective MoS\(_2\) monolayer with S monovacancy were studied. The OER/ORR performance was strongly dependent on the size of the anchored Pd clusters: Pd\(_6\)/MoS\(_2\) presents the highest activity toward ORR with a 0.59 V overpotential, and Pd\(_2\)/MoS\(_2\) shows the highest activity on OER with a low overpotential of 0.32 V.\(^{21}\) Juan et al. investigated the impact of structural stability of small Pt clusters with different conformations on Au (111) by employing DFT methods. A triatomic cluster of Pt was found to be more stable on Au (111) with a linear conformation. For clusters with four or more atoms, Pt on Au (111) prefers non-linear conformation.\(^{54}\)

Adsorbates descriptor

The adsorbed free energy of the intermediate is also a suitable descriptor of the cluster to describe OER and ORR activity. Wang’s research group explored the OER/ORR activity of a single TM atom doped phthalocyanine (TM@Pcs, TM = Mn, Fe, Co, etc.) through a computational screening approach (Figure 8C).\(^{55}\) In metal-phthalocyanine, there exists a metal-N-C structure in metal-phthalocyanine, which was verified as the active site for ORR. Based on the different rate-limiting step in OER and ORR, the \(\Delta G_{\text{OH}}\) and \(\Delta G_{\text{O}} - \Delta G_{\text{OH}}\) were considered as the independent descriptors for OER and ORR, respectively. Rh@Pc were considered as the potential bifunctional electrocatalysts due to low overpotential of 0.44 V in OER and 0.55 V in ORR (Figure 8D). Meanwhile, the metal center can be tightly bound with phthalocyanine monolayers confirmed by the high diffusion energy barriers, leading to the anti-aggregation of metal centers.
The surface active site of the cluster and the coverage of adsorbates both contribute to the OER/ORR performance. The adsorption surface is not a clean surface during the catalytic process but a dynamic surface including various adsorbed intermediates and solvents. Pei’s research showed that the alkaline conditions with the pre-adsorption of hydroxyl groups are beneficial for the OER and ORR in hydroxyl group modified single metal and bimetal atoms supported on defective graphene (denoted as HO-M/DG and (HO)₂-M'⁻²DG, M = Ni, Co, Fe and M', M' = Ni, Co, Fe). While the pre-adsorption of hydroxyl groups is not profitable for HO-Ni/DG hybrid, due to the unstable adsorbed of *OH, *O, and *OOH in OER and ORR process. Hence, the HO-Ni/defective graphene cannot be recognized as an effective oxygen redox electrocatalyst. Understanding the catalytic mechanism of the surface cluster configuration and dynamic change in the OER/ORR process would be a challenge (Figures 9A–9C).

Composite descriptor
The cluster-scale structure has abundant unsaturated coordination active sites and has a good fine-tuning effect on its edge performance with the change of size. It was found that the smaller the size of amorphous carbon is, the more edges the system will have, which exposes with rich active sites. The exposed edge sites facilitate the performance of oxygen redox electrocatalysis. While in Sun’s group, they found that the basal carbon in small carbon cluster were considered as the optimal active sites. They doped oxygen groups in the amorphous carbon cluster according to the CO₂-assisted ball-milling process. On the basis of quantum chemical calculations, the *OOH is the key intermediates as a function of overpotential and controlled by the composite electronic descriptor of radical Fukui function. The Fukui function can describe the adsorption capability of the rate-determined intermediate *OOH and it indicates that the carbon atom located at the center of the total carbon cluster is considered as the most active site in H₂O₂ production, defined as follows (Equation 18):

\[ F_k^2 = \frac{1}{2} [p_k(N + 1) - p_k(N - 1)] \]  

(Equation 18)

The \( p_k(N + 1) \) and \( p_k(N - 1) \) are the electronic populations of atom \( k \) in the cases when the carbon surface obtains and loses one electron, respectively.

Descriptor development for bulk macroscale catalysts
The bulk macroscale catalysts, such as TM oxides/sulfides, metal alloys, and molecular organic frameworks have emerged as one of the most promising catalysts for oxygen redox catalysis. Among the kinds of bulk catalysts, TM oxides are the traditional bifunctional catalysts, owing to the unique surface oxygen coordination structure, the advantages of corrosion resistance in alkaline media, moderate cost, and low environmental hazards. A plentiful of common TM-based catalysts including binary oxides \( M_xO_y \) (\( M = \text{Mn, Co, Ni} \)), bimetallic hydroxyl oxides (\( \text{M}'\text{M}''\text{OOH} \), particularly with \( \text{M}' = \text{Fe, Ni} \)), spinel, conventional perovskites \( \text{AMO}_3 \), and quadruple perovskites \( \text{AMn}_7\text{O}_{12} \) (\( A = \text{Ca and La} \)) were progressively investigated in recent years. The macroscale TM oxides display the unique characteristics of diverse active sites, atomic coordination structures, and adsorption models of intermediates (bridge-cis and top-ads). Their intermediate descriptors (\( \Delta G_{O_{2}} - \Delta G_{\text{OH}} \) for OER and \( \Delta G_{\text{OH}} \) for ORR) and the multi-component descriptors including physical and chemical properties are complicated in the electrocatalytic process. Decades of research show that the electronic spin structure of the active metal center is the main factor that affects the OER and ORR activity, directly correlating to the adsorption free energy of intermediates. Those electronic structures of materials are mainly inherited from the coordination environment of bulk TM oxide, and thus, the bulk descriptors comprise electron filling in the d-shell and \( e_g^* \) orbitals, d-band center, oxygen p-band center, and charge transfer energy.

d electronic descriptors
The electron-filling state of \( d \) orbitals is always a useful descriptor to describe the relationship between adsorbed intermediate and OER/ORR electrocatalytic activity. The model proposed by Zaanen, Sawai, and Allen (ZSA model) is an early theory that has great potential in describing OER/ORR activity and predicting semiconductor band structure in the early stage. It was observed that the potential energy induced by the interaction is not the most critical factor of the energy band but is the magnitude of the charge transfer energy (\( \Delta \)) which is defined as the energy of an electron transferring from \( p \) orbital in ligand to \( d \) orbital in TM. Kirsanova’s group investigated the activity of YBaCoO₇₋₄ structure by using ZSA models. The OER rate-limiting step is linearly related to \( \Delta \) (charge transfer energy of O 2p band separated from upper Hubbard bands), while the ORR rate-limiting step is related to \( U \) (the energy difference
of d-manifold split band of upper and lower Hubbard band, induced by d-orbital Coulomb repulsion). It indicates that the Coulomb repulsion is a key factor for the rate-limiting step of ORR and OER. It was also found that the metal active site in the tetrahedral structure has a larger $U$ value and higher ORR activity, endowing the tetrahedral-coordinated Co the catalytically active center (Figures 10A and 10B). Andersen’s group verified that the existing d-bandwidth is the effective descriptor of *O adsorption enthalpy change through the compressive sensing method. They added the coordination atoms with the adsorbate, ionization potential and the Milliken electronegativity in the descriptor.65

The d-band theory is also expanded to investigate dynamic processes in the oxygen redox reaction. In Kang’s work,15 the dynamic surface engineering occurring on perovskite LaMnO$_3$ structure in OER/ORR process and was studied to determine the in-situ catalytic mechanism of oxide catalysts. They found that OER/ORR performance is highly correlated with the $e_g$ band of the surface metal atoms and charge transfer between adsorbates and surface oxygen atoms. The surface d electronic state directly impact the binding strength of the key oxygenated intermediates. Kim and coworkers proposed that the reduced gap between d- and p-band centers ($D_{Ed-p}$) of Sm$_{0.5}$Sr$_{0.5}$CoO$_3$ can improve the OER/ORR activity, showing that the overpotential is controlled by either d or oxidation states of TMs (Figure 10C).66

Apart from TM oxide, MXene is a general term for a class of two-dimensional metal carbides, nitrides or carbonitrides with the chemical formula M$_{n+1}$X$_n$T$_x$ (T stands for surface O and F functional groups), due to its excellent electrical conductivity, chemical stability and tunable chemical surface. The local electronic environment and coordination environment of MXene can be effectively regulated by a surface atomic modification to optimize catalytic performance. In Zhang’s theoretical work, they explore the OER/ORR performance of atomically dispersed binary Fe/Co/Ni sites embedded in Ti$_2$CO$_2$. The thermodynamic and kinetic stability of nine diatomic models were used for OER/ORR bifunctional catalysts. The d electrons and work function were explored as useful descriptors to investigate the bifunctional catalytic performance and electronic structure of FeCoNi diatomic/Ti$_2$CO$_2$ catalysts.67

e$_g$ orbital filling descriptor

The $e_g$ orbital filling is another normal descriptor for TM oxide system, predicting electron spin state, outer electrons, and occupancy that is directly related to the adsorption enthalpy of O-containing
intermediates. Xu’s research group (Figures 11A and 11B) investigated the OER/ORR performance descriptors of a series of MnCo$_2$O$_4$ structures. They found that the activity of Mn depends on a volcano-type curve of $e_g$ occupancy, indicating that the activity of the octahedral-based Mn element is manipulated by the filling state of the $e_g$ orbital. Qiu’s research group calculated the $e_g$ electron change of Co sites in high-entropy oxide structures through the DFT method (Figures 11C and 11D). AlCoFeMoCr composition shows the highest OER performance among different kinds of high-entropy oxides, in which $e_g$ is closest to 0. Additionally, the $e_g$ orbital filling also depends on the dimensional and size of TM oxide. Chen et al. prepared three-dimensional nanospheres and one-dimensional nanowires LaNi$_{0.3}$Mn$_{0.7}$O$_3$ materials and found that the Mn$^{3+}$ ions in the one-dimensional nanowire structure presents a higher spin degree of $t_{2g}$ $e_g$ and thereby leading to the better catalytic performance with regarding to the low spin degree three-dimensional nanospheres counterpart (Figure 11E). For ABO$_3$-type catalysts (A = La, La$_{0.5}$Sr$_{0.5}$, Sr, B = Mn, Fe, Co, Ni), OER and ORR behavior can also be well-described by unpaired valence electrons (N) and nominal valence charge (V) of B atom in the bulk ABO$_3$. While the relationships between the electronic state and the catalytic activity for OER and ORR show different trends in many Ni-based and Mn-based systems. The difference mainly originated from the various dynamics in OER and ORR process. There exist linear correlation and second-order reaction relationship between Ni/Mn 3d density of states and OER/ORR performance, respectively.

Geometry descriptors
Ham’s group performed DFT calculations to study and predict the properties of Pt-based Pt$_3$M/Pt nanomaterials, aiming to design superior bifunctional alloy OER/ORR electrocatalysts. The stability of...
Pt₃M/Pt catalysts was calibrated by volume formation energy against surface separation energy. The thermodynamic rate-limiting steps were discussed by calculating the adsorption energy of intermediates in the OER/ORR reaction. The catalytic activity and stability are highly relevant to a series of geometric properties including the strain, core structure, lattice distance, and coordination environment, change of the core lattice distance and surface atomic coordination. Xia’s work explored the performance of the core-shell structure of Ag₃₂X₆ and found that the shell stress of the core-shell structure can be used as an effective descriptor to describe the activity of bifunctional catalysts. In Ag₃₂X₆ core-shell structures, the compressive stress induces a more positive charge on the surface of the shell, leading to a higher catalytic activity. Zhang’s group constructed a series of biatom doped Ti₂CO₃ structures and

Figure 11. The relationship between e_g orbital filling and OER/ORR performance
(A) Spinel crystal structure with the octahedral site and tetrahedral site.
(B) ORR/OER limiting potential as a function of nominal Mn valence state on various MnCo₂O₄ spinels. Reproduced with permission from.²⁵ Copyright 2017 Wiley-VCH.
(C) Atomic structure of the doped CoFe₂O₄. Reproduced with permission from.²³ copyright 2021 American Chemical Society.
(D) |eₓₓ| of the surface Co in doped and undoped spinel CoFe₂O₄. Reproduced with permission from.²⁵ copyright 2021 American Chemical Society.
(E) Schematic illustration of the BO₆ octahedra structure and electron configurations of t₂g and e_g orbitals of Ni²⁺ and Mn²⁺ in LaNiₓMn₁₋ₓO₃. Reproduced with permission from.⁶⁸ Copyright 2022 American Chemical Society.
found that the structural disorder in MXene can be well defined by microstrain, which can calculated as Equation 19:

\[
\text{Microstrain} = f(\%M) + D \cdot SD
\]  

(Equation 19)

The f(\%M) is sum of bulk chemical disorder (obtained by DFT calculations and experiments) and surface defectiveness (SD), weighted by the surface-to-volume ratio (D).71 The microstrain induced by dopant atoms is the descriptor to describe the structure fluctuation stability and catalytic activity (Figures 12A–12D).

Structural stability is a performance criterion of OER/ORR activity.74 Saidi’s research group calculated the \( ^\bullet \text{OH} \) adsorption energy on the surface of PdAuAgTi series alloys with lower computational time and higher accuracy.72 They found that substitutions of Au and Ag with Cu and Zn can produce better ORR catalysts. The thermodynamic stability of the alloy can be gauged by inspecting atomic radius difference between various metal elements (\( \delta_i \)), the mixed entropy (\( \Delta S_{\text{mix}} \)), and the mixed enthalpy (\( \Delta H_{\text{mix}} \)). Those three parameters have great advantages for predicting the stability of the test system at different temperatures (Figures 12E and 12F).

**Compound descriptors**

For bulk electrocatalysts, the compound descriptor is complicated and mainly correlated with frontier electronic state which is near Fermi level. Li and coworkers explored the OER/ORR performance of
various metal-doped vanadium carbide (VC) crystal with exposed (001) lattice plane on the basis of DFT theory. The TMs were doped in VC to modulate the binding strength of key intermediates according to the change of chemical coordinated environment and corresponding electronic states. In these TMs-doped VC catalysts, the $d$-band center theory is not proper to describe the performance change due to every electronic state not presenting similar contributions to the bonding strength between adsorbates and catalyst surface. Although the entire frontier electronic band on the catalyst surface is active, the contribution also relates to the distance from their energy levels to the Fermi level. Thus, they introduced the fermi-abundance model to describe the catalytic activity of oxygen redox electrocatalysts on TM doped VC surfaces (Figure 13). The Fermi-abundance ($D_F$) is defined as Equation 20:

$$D_F = \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} ED(E)W(E)dE}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} D(E)W(E)dE} = \frac{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} ED'(E)dE}{\int_{-\infty}^{+\infty} D'(E)dE}$$  \hspace{1cm} (Equation 20)

where $D'(E) = D(E)W(E)$ and $W(E)$ is the weight function ($W(E) = -f_T(E - E_F)$) with the prime (') representing the derivative.

$f_T (E - E_F)$ is the Fermi–Dirac distribution function and is calculated by:

$$f_T(E - E_F) = \frac{1}{\exp[(E - E_F)/kT] + 1}$$  \hspace{1cm} (Equation 21)

where $kT$ (0.1–1 eV) is the nominal electron temperature. The spreading of $W(E)$ can be adjusted by $kT$.

**CONCLUSIONS AND OUTLOOK**

Taking advantages of high-throughput computing and machine learning methods, the structure-activity relation can be studied from a wide range of degrees of freedom and descriptors can be effectively extracted from the atomic microscale, cluster mesoscale, and bulk macroscale catalysts. However, the feature engineering
toward constructing multiscale descriptors for prediction of novel catalysts remain a big challenge. Much more effort should be taken to the multiscale research and propose descriptors that link the overpotential with the structure and properties of catalysts for OER/ORR. Several important issues deserve exploration.

1. The performance of electrocatalysts for OER/ORR can be affected by various factors such as defects, solvation effect, and surface coverage. The single-component descriptor cannot effectively evaluate the activity trend for all catalysts. Developing descriptors containing multi-factors is indeed necessary to describe the structure-performance relationship.

2. From the atomic scale, the activity of OER/ORR electrocatalysts is determined by the geometrical and electronic structures of active sites, while it is also influenced by flux of solvents and electrical field from the macroscale. Seeking cross-scale descriptors that contain the experimental and test environmental feature parameters is directional to enhance the prediction accuracy of novel electrocatalysts.

3. The OER and ORR are complicated electrochemical processes, including dynamic proton-electron transfer and dynamic evolution of active sites during reactions. The current descriptors are mainly based on the static electronic structure and geometric structure. More attention should be paid to capture the dynamic feature descriptors of electrocatalysis.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This work was financially supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (52033030, 52020105010, M-0755), the Natural Science Foundation of Guangdong Province (2022A1515010076), the Natural Science Foundation of Shandong Province (ZR2020ZD35), the SIAT Innovation Program for Excellent Young Researchers (E2G017), and the CAS president’s international fellowship initiative grant (2022 VEA0011, 2022VEA0016, 2022VEA0017). The Shenzhen Science and Technology Program (SGDX2021 1123151002003).

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTIONS

C. P., C.Y. Z., and D.F. X. supervised the preparation of this review article. D.T. Z. contributed to the most of the writing and Qi. Z. contributed to some content and figures. Z. L. and G.L. Z. revised the manuscript. D.K. and S. K. revised and finalized the manuscript. All author approved the final version of the manuscript.

DECLARATION OF INTERESTS

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

REFERENCES


